

Personality, Fantasy, and Spirituality: Comparing Analog Role-players to Other Populations

Joshua Juvrud

Uppsala University, Department of Game Design

joshua.juvrud@speldesign.uu.se

Sarah Lynne Bowman, Kjell Hedgard Hugaas

Uppsala University, Department of Game Design

Uppsala University, Department of Game Design

sarah.bowman@speldesign.uu.se, kjell.hedgard.hugaas@speldesign.uu.se

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Analog role-playing games (RPGs) require a remarkable amount of spontaneous co-creative play compared to many other types of games, where the vast majority of the game occurs in the playground of the mind. Even in live action role-playing games (larp) that feature a 360 degree illusion (Koljonen 2008) or indexical realism (Pettersson 2018), in which the environment is almost exactly like reality, play itself occurs within each player's imagination, called subjective diegesis (Montola 2003, 2012).

This ability to shift into a different character and project fantasy onto reality has historically been considered suspect. In the nineteenth century, because they enact alternate roles, actors were assumed to be untrustworthy, dangerous, and even criminal (Bates 1988; Bowman 2015). Similar labels are sometimes placed on role-players. Since the advent of *Dungeons & Dragons* (1974), role-players have been accused of escapist behavior. Such accusations have led to moral panics, e.g., the Satanic Panic (Stark 2012; Laycock 2015), exemplified in the film *Mazes and Monsters* (1982) as well as academic research claiming that RPGs have negative psychological impacts on players (Ascherman 1993). Such concerns are also echoed in larger discourses on the supposedly negative psychological impacts of video games on players (e.g., Anderson et al. 2010, Gentile et al., 2004), and other forms of antisocial behavior (Happ et al. 2013).

Meanwhile, academic studies emphasizing the positive psychological and social benefits of analog role-playing games have become relatively pervasive in recent years (e.g. Daniau 2016). The educational potential of role-playing games in non-formal, formal, and informal applications is also being widely explored (Garcia 2016; Geneuss 2021; Baird 2022; Cullinan & Genova 2023; Westborg 2023). Mental health professionals increasingly are using tabletop role-playing games in therapeutic practice to improve social skills (Abbott et al. 2021; Varrette et al. 2023) and psychological well being (Gutierrez 2017; Atanasio 2020). Three literature reviews on

Proceedings of DiGRA 2024

© 2024 Authors & Digital Games Research Association DiGRA. Personal and educational classroom use of this paper is allowed, commercial use requires specific permission from the author.

the academic discourse have been conducted in recent years with positive findings about the therapeutic value of these games (Arenas et al. 2022; Henrich et al. 2021; Baker et al. 2022) and two books on therapeutic game-mastering were released by academic publishers (Connell 2023; Kilmer et al. 2023). In the wider field of game studies researchers have shown that playing games and identifying as a gamer lead to new friendships in school (Eklund and Roman 2019) and how gaming supports friendship formation (Kowert et al. 2014; Molyneux et al. 2015).

While analog role-playing gamers have been studied along different personality dimensions (e.g. Douse and McManus 1993; Wilson 2007; Carter and Lester 1998; and Lorenz et al. 2022), the results tend to be inconclusive. Also of interest is the degree to which role-players tend to experience mysticism, greater creativity, and/or beliefs in the paranormal. Do certain psychological tendencies exist in people drawn to engage in spontaneous adult pretend play, or pretensive shared imagination (Kapitany et al. 2022) with regard to personality, fantasy, and spiritual experience? Are tendencies toward neuroticism and/or psychoticism correlated with role-playing experience?

Our study addresses these questions by conducting online quantitative surveys of gamers and members of related subcultures in a two-stage process. The first stage involved participants taking surveys on their personality traits with the Big Five Inventory (BFI-20; Gouvia et al., 2021); perspective taking and empathy with the Interpersonal Reactivity Index (IRI) (Davis 1980); and attachment styles with the Experiences in Close Relationships (ECR) scale. The second stage measured absorption, fantasy proneness and other characteristics through the Multidimensional Personality Questionnaire Short Form (MPS) absorption scale (Patrick et al. 2002) and sensitivity to psychological material either in the unconscious and/or the external environment (Thalbourne and Maltby 2008) with the Revised Transliminality Scale (Lange et al. 2000). Participants were asked to identify their degree of participation in a number of different types of play activities, as well as related subcultural activities.

The study was approved by the The Swedish Ethical Review Authority (2023-04552-02) before data collection. Participants reviewed a consent form before beginning study, and received a password, as well as email reminders to participate in Part II. The survey was sent to several relevant groups on Facebook (convenience sample) and shared in a snowball method, including with groups focused on analog role-playing games. In addition the survey was also shared with students in Game Design and Psychology at Uppsala University, posted on game related forums on Reddit, as well as shared via the DiGRA mailing list.

Our survey gathered data from 332 respondents, of which 214 self-defined as “gamer” and 118 self-identified as “non-gamer”. At the time of writing, we have just started to clean and analyze the large datasets gathered, and the time frame has only allowed us to focus primarily on correlations.

An initial analysis of our data found that live action role-players (larpers) that had been participated in at least one game in the last year, showed higher scores than players who had not larped in the last year in:

- Openness to experience

- Extraversion,
- Neuroticism
- Avoidant attachment style
- Absorption, and
- Transliminality

Furthermore, in looking at respondents who reported that they enjoy playing any type of analog role-playing game vs. those who did not report enjoying any analog role-playing game, we found:

- Higher openness to experience in those who enjoy
- Higher neuroticism in those who enjoy
- Higher absorption in those who enjoy, and
- Higher transliminality in those who enjoy

When we looked at the scores of self-identified “gamers” and “non-gamers” we found significant differences.

Non-gamers showed:

- Higher conscientiousness
- Higher agreeableness
- Higher perspective taking

Gamers showed:

- Higher fantasy-proneness (subscale of absorption).

Connections with Previous Findings

According to Rense Lange, the originator of the transliminality scale, ours is the first study that uses the scale to specifically study gamers. Furthermore, to our knowledge, attachment styles in RPG players has not been the focus of previous studies.

Openness to experience:

Lorenz et al. (2022) reported finding that analog role-players showed higher scores in openness.

Neuroticism:

Lorenz et al. (2022) reported finding that analog role-players showed lower scores in neuroticism. While using the Eysenck Personality Inventory, Douse and Mcmanus (1993) and Carter and Lester (1998) found no difference in neuroticism between role-players and control groups.

Extraversion:

Lawson (2007) found that role-players scored significantly higher for introversion on the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator. Douse and Mcmanus (1993) reported similar findings, but Lorenz et al. (2022) reported a similar significant result for extraversion.

Empathic Concern: Douse and McManus (1993) found that role-players scored significantly lower on empathic concern than non-players. Rivers et al. (2016) found that role-players scored significantly higher on empathic concern.

Absorption: Whereas Rivers et al. (2016) only looked at analog role-players, and did not compare to non-players, they found a significant positive correlation between empathic concern and absorption levels.

Limitations

332 respondents are on the smaller side, and we would have liked to gather more data. Our dataset seems to also be skewed towards analog role-players, which we believe might be a result of the convenience sample. Since our survey consisted of two parts, this also led to some attrition in participant numbers between phase 1 and 2.

Furthermore, we did not ask questions about longevity of play, i.e. “how long have you played,” which we in retrospect believe might have added valuable insights. We believe that we in our future work should further analyze data related to different types of role-players, e.g., MMORPGs, tabletop, larp, CRPGs, etc.

Finally, this study only covers English speaking players and as such is not able to be globally representative of all gamers, role-players, and “non-gamers.” Other important data such as gender, ethnicity, neurodiversity, etc. has not been included here but will be analyzed and reported later. Statistical scores will be reported in later work after final data analysis is complete.

Keywords

Role-playing games, psychology of play, absorption, transliminality, empathy, perspective taking, personality, attachment

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge Daelyn Boscarino from the University of Colorado Boulder who helped set up the survey.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, C. A., et al. 2010. “Violent Video Game Effects on Aggression, Empathy, and Prosocial Behavior in Eastern and Western Countries: A Meta-analytic Review.” *Psychological Bulletin* 136 (2): 151-73. doi:10.1037/a0018251
- Arenas, D. L., Viduani, A., and Araujo, R. B. 2022. “Therapeutic Use of Role-Playing Game (RPG) in Mental Health: A Scoping Review.” *Simulation & Gaming* (March 2022).

- Ascherman, L. I. 1993. "The Impact of Unstructured Games of Fantasy and Role playing on an Inpatient Unit for Adolescents." *International Journal of Group Psychotherapy* 43 (3): 335-344, DOI: 10.1080/00207284.1993.11732597
- Atanasio, J. F. 2020. "Why Older Adventurers Can Beat a Lich: How Dungeons & Dragons Empowers Older Adults." In *Integrating Geek Culture into Therapeutic Practice: The Clinician's Guide to Geek Therapy*, edited by Anthony M. Bean, Emory S. Daniel Jr., Sarah A. Hays, 109-125. Fort Worth, TX, USA: Leyline Publishing.
- Baker, I. S., Turner, I. J., and Kotera, Y. 2022. "Role-play Games (RPGs) for Mental Health (Why Not?): Roll For Initiative." *International Journal of Mental Health and Addiction* 11: 1-9.
- Baird, J. 2022. "Learning About Ourselves: Communicating, Connecting and Contemplating Trans Experience through Play." *Gamevironments* 17: 355-402.
- Bates, B. 1988. *The Way of the Actor: A Path to Knowledge & Power*. Boston, MA: Shambhala. 18-21.
- Bowman, S. L. 2024. "Immersion and Shared Imagination in Role-Playing Games." In *The Routledge Handbook of Role-playing Game Studies*, edited by J. P. Zagal and S. Deterding. London: Routledge.
- Bowman, S. L. 2018. "Immersion and Shared Imagination in Role-Playing Games." In *Role-Playing Game Studies: Transmedia Foundations*, edited by José P. Zagal and S. Deterding, 379-394. New York: Routledge.
- Carter, R., and Lester, D. 1998. "Personalities of Players of Dungeons and Dragons." *Psychological Reports* 82:182. doi: 10.2466/pr0.1998.82.1.182
- Connell, M. 2023. *Tabletop Role-playing Therapy: A Guide for the Clinician Game Master*. W. W. Norton & Company.
- Cullinan, M., and Genova, J. 2023. "Gaming the Systems: A Component Analysis Framework for the Classroom Use of RPGs." *International Journal of Role-Playing* 13: 7-17.
- Daniau, S. 2016. "The Transformative Potential of Role-playing Games: From Play Skills to Human Skills." *Simulation & Gaming* 47(4), 423-444.
- Davis, M. H. 1980. "A Multidimensional Approach to Individual Differences in Empathy." *JSAS Catalog of Selected Documents in Psychology* 10 (85).
- Douse, Neil A., and McManus, I. C. 1993. "The Personality of Fantasy Game Players." *British Journal of Psychology* 84, 505-509. doi: 10.1111/j.2044-8295.1993.tb02498.x
- Eklund, L. and Roman, S. 2019. "Digital Gaming and Young People's Friendships : A Mixed Methods Study of Time Use and Gaming in School." *Young - Nordic Journal of Youth Research* 27 (1): 32-47, doi:10.1177/1103308818754990.

- Garcia, A. 2016. "Teacher as Dungeon Master: Connected Learning, Democratic Classrooms, and Rolling for Initiative." In *The Role-Playing Society: Essays on the Cultural Influence of RPGs*. McFarland and Co., edited by A. Byers and F. Crocco. McFarland.
- Geneuss, K. 2021. "The Use of the Role-playing Technique STARS in Formal Didactic Contexts." *International Journal of Role-Playing* 11: 114-131.
- Gentile, D. A., Lynch, P. J., Linder, J. R., and Walsh, D. A. 2004. "The Effects of Violent Video Game Habits on Adolescent Hostility, Aggressive Behaviors, and School Performance." *Journal of Adolescence* 27 (1): 5-22.
doi:10.1016/j.adolescence.2003.10.002
- Gutierrez, R. 2017. "Therapy & Dragons: A look into the Possible Applications of the Possible Applications of Table Top Role Playing Games in Therapy with Adolescents." *Electronic Theses, Projects, and Dissertations* 527: 1-39.
<https://scholarworks.lib.csusb.edu/etd/527>
- Happ, C., Melzer, A., and Steffgen, G. 2013. "Superman vs. BAD Man? The Effects of Empathy and Game Character in Violent Video Games." *Cyberpsychology, Behavior and Social Networking* 16 (10): 774-8. doi:10.1089/cyber.2012.0695
- Henrich, S., and Worthington, R. 2021. "Let Your Clients Fight Dragons: A Rapid Evidence Assessment Regarding the Therapeutic Utility of 'Dungeons & Dragons'." *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health* 18 (3): 1-19.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15401383.2021.1987367>
- Kapitany, R., Hampejs, T., and Goldstein, T. R. 2022. "Pretensive Shared Reality: From Childhood Pretense to Adult Imaginative Play." *Frontiers in Psychology* 13 (February 28): 774085. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2022.774085
- Kilmer, E. D., Davis, A. D., Kilmer, J. N., and Johns, A. R. 2023. *Therapeutically Applied Role-playing Games: The Game to Grow Method*. Routledge.
- Koljonen, J. 2008. "The Dragon Was the Least of It: Dragonbane and LARP as Ephemera and Ruin." In *Playground Worlds: Creating and Evaluating Experiences of Role-playing Games*, edited by Markus Montola and Jaakko Stenros, 33-52. Jyvaskyla, Finland: Ropecon ry.
- Kowert, R., Domahidi, E., Festl, R., and Quandt, T. 2014. "Social Gaming, Lonely Life? The Impact of Digital Game Play on Adolescents' Social Circles." *Computers in Human Behavior* 36: 385-390. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2014.04.003>
- Lange, R., Thalbourne, M. A., Houran, J., & Storm, L. 2000. "The Revised Transliminality Scale: Reliability and Validity Data from a Rasch Top-down Purification Procedure." *Consciousness and Cognition*, (9)4, 591-617.
doi:10.1006/ccog.2000.0472

- Lorenz, T., Hagitte, L., and Brandt, M. 2022. "Do Not Make Me Roll Initiative: Assessing the Big Five Characteristics of Dungeons & Dragons Players in Comparison to Non-players." *Frontiers in Psychology* 13 (October 19): 1-8.
- Montola, M. 2003. "Role-playing as Interactive Construction of Subjective Diegeses." In *As Larp Grows Up*, edited by Gade, M., Thorup, L., and Sander, M., 82-89. Denmark: Projektgruppen KP03.
- Montola, M. 2012. *On the Edge of the Magic Circle: Understanding Role-Playing and Pervasive Games*. PhD diss, University of Tampere.
- Patrick, C. J., Curtin, J. J., and Tellegen, A. 2002. "Development and Validation of a Brief Form of the Multidimensional Personality Questionnaire (MPQ)." *Psychological Assessment*, 14: 150-163.
- Pettersson, J. 2018. "Lobbying for the Dead – Vampire larp at the European Parliament." Nordiclarp.org, January 23.
- Rivers, A., Wickramasekera II, I.E., Pekala, R.J., and Rivers, J.A. 2016. "Empathic Features and Absorption in Fantasy Role-Playing." *American Journal of Clinical Hypnosis* 58: 286–294.
- Veloso Gouveia, V., et al. 2021. "A Short Version of the Big Five Inventory (BFI-20): Evidence on Construct Validity." *Revista Interamericana De Psicología/Interamerican Journal of Psychology* 55, no. 1: e1312. <https://doi.org/10.30849/ripijp.v55i1.1312>
- Varrette, M., Berkenstock, J., Greenwood-Ericksen, A., Ortega, A., Michaels, F., Pietrobon, V., and Schodorf, M. 2023. "Exploring the Efficacy of Cognitive Behavioral Therapy and Role-playing Games as an Intervention for Adults with Social Anxiety." *Social Work with Groups* 46 (2): 140-165.
- Westborg, J. 2023. "The Educational Role-Playing Game Design Matrix: Mapping Design Components onto Types of Education." *International Journal of Role-playing* 13: 18-30.