Super Memory Makers:
Livestreaming and/as videogame
play archives

James Manning
RMIT University
124 La Trobe St
Melbourne VIC 3000
james.manning@rmit.edu.au

Keywords

Livestreaming, archives, play cultures, hegemony of play, Super Mario Maker

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Using *Super Mario Maker* (Nintendo EAD 2015; SMM hereafter) as its example, this paper appraises the "incidental archives" (Manning 2017) of gameplay produced by livestreamers. Similar to other forms of "high-performance play" (Lowood 2006) such as speedrunning, many of the feats performed by the most popular SMM streamers are unparalleled in terms of their virtuosic skills and technical achievements. Here, the extent to which these performances document and reveal the inner workings of a game system, its affordances and capabilities are certainly worth noting (Newman 2011; 2012a). However, the overabundance and prevalence of such content have a hegemonic effect (Fron et al. 2007). This combined with the popularity of video-sharing platforms such as YouTube and Niconico risks eliding evidence of other play styles and especially the more autotelic forms of play that SMM engenders. The result: a distorted historical record of what actual SMM play looks like.

SMM was released on 10 September 2015 for the Nintendo Wii U console to coincide with the 30th-anniversary release of *Super Mario Bros* for the Japanese Famicom system. Widely acclaimed by critics and fans alike, SMM granted players the tools and networked features to play, create and share their own 2D Mario levels. Within the first month after release, Nintendo reported 2.2 million courses had been uploaded to their servers (Nintendo of Europe 2015) with 7.2 million courses within the first eight months (Nintendo of America 2016). Four years later on 28 June 2019, *Super Mario Maker 2* (Nintendo EAD 2019) was released for the Nintendo Switch console superseding both SMM and the Wii U console. On 31 March 2021, Nintendo discontinued SMM features which removed the ability for players to upload further courses (Nintendo Support n.d.). At this time of writing, courses are still accessible yet it is highly unlikely Nintendo will continue to keep this service running for much longer. Inevitability and at some point, both SMM and the Wii U will reach the end of their commercial hence supported lifespans. What thereafter happens to this prodigious database of player-produced content?

The contingent nature of videogames and videogame technology presents archivists with an imminent concern (Winget 2011b). Contemporary videogames exist within networked infrastructures enabling software to be consistently patched and updated with new content being generated by both players and developers alike (Newman 2012a). Despite ongoing efforts, emulation and virtualization strategies appear inadequate (cf Pinchbeck et al. 2009; Rosenthal 2015). Claims of accurate reproduction

are unfounded and often produce perceptively different results (Hedstrom et al. 2006). Accounting for such variability is one possible solution (Depocas, Ippolito, and Jones 2003; Røssaak 2010) whereas others have proposed alternative strategies better suited to capture the protean nature of videogames and the emergent gameplay practices they engender (Kraus and Donahue 2012; Lowood 2002; 2011; McDonough et al. 2010; Newman 2012a; 2012b; Stuckey et al. 2013; Winget 2011a).

Using SMM as its case study, this paper assesses the merits and shortcomings of what Lowood (2002) calls for in the creation of a "game performance archive". A strategy that elsewhere Lowood (2011) describes as a move beyond software preservation to include capturing the social and performative aspects of videogame play. For Newman, this marks a shift "from game preservation to game*play* preservation" (2012a, 38; original emphasis).

This paper is presented in three parts. First, it demonstrates how livestreaming practices preserve for future observation the everchanging assemblage of play (Giddings and Kennedy 2008; Taylor 2009) which, when viewed in combination, can be used to chronicle how videogames evolve (Manning 2017).

Second, it contends how dominant cultural values and viewer expectations influence the type of play captured and performed. As Taylor (2018, 86) acknowledges, livestreamers adopt a particular style of play called "performative play". To attract and maintain large viewing audiences, performers modulate their performances to align with social norms and expectations. As such, whilst records invariably do persist, they too are often highly curated affairs tightly edited to showcase personality and player skill not to perform as archival records.

This leads to third, how the hegemony of play (Fron et al. 2007) marginalizes certain players and omits certain play styles from historical records. Much work has already lamented how sexist (Fox and Tang 2014; 2017; Ruberg, Cullen, and Brewster 2019) and racist (Gray 2012; 2017) online spaces are which directly affect who gets to play in public and participate online (Shaw 2014). The historical events which privileged agonistic over autotelic forms of play (Kirkpatrick 2017; Kocurek 2015) are examined alongside the values associated with "real" games and gamers (Consalvo and Paul 2019). This paper concludes by highlighting some of the additional struggles faced by those whose play styles and agendas do not adhere to dominant expectations.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Consalvo, Mia, and Christopher A. Paul. 2019. *Real Games: What's Legitimate and What's Not in Contemporary Videogames*. Playful Thinking. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press.

Depocas, Alain, Jon Ippolito, and Caitlin Jones. 2003. *Permanence Through Change: The Variable Media Approach*. New York: Guggenheim Museum Publications.

Fox, Jesse, and Wai Yen Tang. 2014. "Sexism in Online Video Games: The Role of Conformity to Masculine Norms and Social Dominance Orientation." *Computers in Human Behavior* 33 (April): 314–20. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2013.07.014.

———. 2017. "Women's Experiences with General and Sexual Harassment in Online Video Games: Rumination, Organizational Responsiveness, Withdrawal, and Coping Strategies." *New Media & Society* 19 (8): 1290–1307. https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444816635778.

Fron, Janine, Tracy Fullerton, Jacquelyn Morie, Ford, and Celia Pearce. 2007. "The Hegemony of Play." *Situated Play, Proceedings of DiGRA 2007 Conference*, 309–18.

Giddings, Seth, and Helen W Kennedy. 2008. "Little Jesuses and Fuck- off Robots: On Aesthetics, Cybernetics, and Not Being Very Good at Lego Star Wars." In *The Pleasures of Computer Gaming: Essays on Cultural History, Theory and Aesthetics*, edited by Melanie Swalwell and Jason A. Wilson, 13–32. Jefferson, NC: McFarland. http://eprints/uwe.ac.uk/8360.

Gray, Kishonna L. 2012. "Intersecting Oppressions and Online Communities." *Information, Communication & Society* 15 (3): 411–28. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118X.2011.642401.

Gray, Kishonna L. 2017. "'They're Just Too Urban':" In *Digital Sociologies*, edited by Jessie Daniels, Karen Gregory, and Tressie McMillan Cottom, 1st ed., 355–68. Bristol University Press. https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctt1t89cfr.28.

Hedstrom, Margaret L, Christopher A Lee, Judith S Olson, and Clifford A Lampe. 2006. "'The Old Version Flickers More': Digital Preservation from the User's Perspective." *American Archivist* 69 (1): 159–87.

Kirkpatrick, Graeme. 2017. "How Gaming Became Sexist: A Study of UK Gaming Magazines 1981–1995." *Media, Culture & Society* 39 (4): 453–68. https://doi.org/10.1177/0163443716646177.

Kocurek, Carly A. 2015. *Coin-Operated Americans: Rebooting Boyhood at the Video Game Arcade*. Minneapolis and London: University Of Minnesota Press.

Kraus, Kari, and Rachel Donahue. 2012. "'Do You Want to Save Your Progress ?': The Role of Professional and Player Communities in Preserving Virtual Worlds Risks to Videogame Longevity." *Digital Humanities Quarterly* 6 (2): 1–18.

Lowood, Henry. 2002. "Shall We Play a Game: Thoughts on the Computer Game Archive of the Future." *Bits of Culture Conference, Stanford University*, 1–19.

———. 2006. "High-Performance Play: The Making of Machinima." *Journal of Media Practice* 7 (1): 25–42. https://doi.org/10.1386/jmpr.7.1.25/1.

———. 2011. "Perfect Capture: Three Takes on Replay, Machinima and the History of Virtual Worlds." *Journal of Visual Culture* 10 (1): 113–24. https://doi.org/10.1177/1470412910391578.

Manning, James. 2017. "Unusable Archives: Everyday Play and the Everyplay Archives." In *Fans and Videogames: Histories, Fandoms and Archives*, edited by Melanie Swalwell, Helen Stuckey, and Angela Ndalianis, 197–213. New York and London: Routledge.

McDonough, Jerome, Robert Olendorf, Matthew Kirschenbaum, Kris Kraus, Doug Reside, Rachel Donahue, Andrew Phelps, Christopher Egert, Henry Lowood, and Susan Rojo. 2010. "Preserving Virtual Worlds Final Report." http://drum.lib.umd.edu/handle/1903/14734.

Newman, James. 2011. "(Not) Playing Games: Player-Produced Walkthroughs as Archival Documents of Digital Gameplay." *International Journal of Digital Curation* 6 (2): 109–27.

———. 2012a. *Best Before: Videogames, Supersession and Obsolescence*. London: Routledge.

———. 2012b. "Illegal Deposit: Game Preservation and/as Software Piracy." *Convergence: The International Journal of Research into New Media Technologies* 19 (1): 45–61. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354856512456790.

Nintendo EAD. 2015. *Super Mario Maker*. Nintendo Wii U. Nintendo.

Nintendo EAD. 2019. *Super Mario Maker 2*. Nintendo Switch. Nintendo.

Nintendo of America. 2016. "If You Played Every Level in #SuperMarioMaker for 1 Minute Each, It Would Take You Nearly 14 Years to Play Them All! Https://T.Co/VEzBMTLGg8." Tweet. *Twitter*. https://twitter.com/NintendoAmerica/status/732624228428750848.

Nintendo of Europe. 2015. "#SuperMarioMaker Has Sold One Million Units Worldwide, with 2.2 Million Courses Being Created so Far! Http://T.Co/PectAtN50x." Tweet. *Twitter*. https://twitter.com/NintendoEurope/status/649177028189659136.

Nintendo Support. n.d. "Nintendo Support: Super Mario Maker for Wii U Discontinuations FAQ." Accessed January 6, 2023. https://en-americas-support.nintendo.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/53854/~/super-mario-maker-for-wii-u-discontinuations-faq.

Pinchbeck, Dan, David Anderson, Janet Delve, and Getaneh Otemu. 2009. "Emulation as a Strategy for the Preservation of Games: The KEEP Project." In *DiGRA '09 - Proceedings of the 2009 DiGRA International Conference: Breaking New Ground: Innovation in Games, Play, Practice and Theory*, 1–5.

Rosenthal, David S H. 2015. "Emulation & Virtualization as Preservation Strategies." Andrew W. Mellon Foundation. https://mellon.org/Rosenthal-Emulation-2015.

Røssaak, Eivind. 2010. *The Archive in Motion: New Conceptions of the Archive in Contemporary Thought and New Media Practices*. Oslo: Novus Press.

Ruberg, Bonnie, Amanda L. L. Cullen, and Kathryn Brewster. 2019. "Nothing but a 'Titty Streamer': Legitimacy, Labor, and the Debate over Women's Breasts in Video Game Live Streaming." *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 36 (5): 466–81. https://doi.org/10.1080/15295036.2019.1658886.

Shaw, Adrienne. 2014. "The Internet Is Full of Jerks, Because the World Is Full of Jerks: What Feminist Theory Teaches Us About the Internet." *Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies* 11 (3): 273–77. https://doi.org/10.1080/14791420.2014.926245.

Stuckey, Helen, Melanie Swalwell, Angela Ndalianis, and Denise De Vries. 2013. "Remembrance of Games Past: The Popular Memory Archive." In *Interactive Entertainment 2013*. http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2513002.2513570.

Taylor, T. L. 2009. "The Assemblage of Play." *Games and Culture* 4 (4): 331–39. https://doi.org/10.1177/1555412009343576.

———. 2018. *Watch Me Play: Twitch and the Rise of Game Live Streaming*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Winget, Megan A. 2011a. "Collecting the Artifacts of Participation: Videogame Players, Fan-Boys, and Individual Models of Collection." In *Digital Media : Technological and Social Challenges of the Interactive World*, edited by Megan A. Winget and William Aspray, 27–72. Scarecrow Press.

———. 2011b. "Videogame Preservation and Massively Multiplayer Online Role-playing Games: A Review of the Literature." *Journal of the American Society*

for Information Science and Technology 62 (10): 1869–83. https://doi.org/10.1002/asi.21530.